

# A publication of the Department of History and Security Studies

Faculty of Humanities, Umaru Musa Yar'adua University, Katsina

## CIVIL SERVICE REFORMS AND THE CHALLENGES OF MODERN ERA IN KATSINA STATE, 1987–2015

## Hadiza Sani Katsina

Department of History and Security Studies Umaru Musa Yar'adua University, Katsina-Nigeria hsanikt4@gmail.com +234(0)8132477911

### Abstract

Reforms are necessary in order to ensure effective service delivery and to promote professionalism. Likewise, there are reforms without challenges. It is against this backdrop that paper through the adoption of historical methodology examines civil service reforms and the challenges of the modern era in Katsina state from 1987 when Katsina was created from old Kaduna State and then to 2015 which marked the emergence of All Progressive Congress (APC) as the opposition government to Peoples' Democratic Party (PDP) which ruled the states for sixteen years (1999-2015). The paper argues that civil service in Katsina state since its creation has undergone a series of administrative and structural reforms under the military and civilian government to ensure effective transformation. Yet some of the reforms implemented instead of enhancing growth and development had rather cripple staff/human resources development, professionalism, accountability, and transparency. Especially the inability to implement a full minimum wage scheme and compulsory retirement/retrenchment of staff without prompt and adequate payment of gratuities and or pension. This coupled with the politicization of the Permanent Secretary Office and other Principal Officers in the civil service. In fact, despite the reforms, such as the development of infrastructure, production of manpower through expansion and development of institutions, massive training and welfare packages. The state civil service and the civil servants have become a shadow of its former.

Keywords: Civil Service, Challenges, Katsina State, Politics, Reforms.

## **INTRODUCTION**

The Nigerian Civil Service as introduced by the British Colonial Officers was an instrument of subjugation used by the British to ensure effective service delivery. Its functions, objectives and structure were narrowed towards ensuring that the colonial officers successfully extracted the much-needed financial and material resources. After independence, the Nigerian government maintained the structure of the Civil Service. However because it was copied from the British, hence not tailored to the development needs of the country; therefore a lot of problems were encountered in service delivery. This necessitated the restructuring and reforming of the Civil Service. The Government introduced certain innovations in the Civil Service to ensure effective service delivery.

In Katsina, the Civil Service has undergone some administrative and structural reforms since its establishment. The state has adopted all the reforms introduced by the Federal Government. But some of the reforms adopted by the state have contributed towards crippling staff development and professionalism.

## Civil Service Reforms in Katsina 1987–2015

Nigeria since independence has set up panels to reform the Civil Service. This is imperative, to establish a Civil Service that is result-oriented.<sup>1</sup> In its bid to provide effective and efficient service, the Katsina State Government has adopted most of the reforms introduced by the Federal Government.<sup>2</sup> This will be seen in the following sub-heading:

#### The 1988 Civil Service Reform in Katsina (Decree No. 43)

The General Ibrahim Babangida regime set up the 1988 Civil Service Reform otherwise known as the Dotun Phillips reform.<sup>3</sup> The reform commission was under the chairmanship of Dotun Phillips. It was set up to study the structure, staffing and operations of the federal and state Civil Service.<sup>4</sup> The contention was that corruption had prevailed in the Civil Service and that the Permanent - Secretaries

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Ake, M. et al. "Nigeria Civil Service Reforms of 1999–2007: An Analysis of the *Controversies*." *In Journal of Pan African Studies*, Vol. 9 No. 3 (2016):66.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>Danyaya, M. Age 64. Retired Civil Servant. Interviewed at Mashi Town, Katsina on 12/9/2018.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup>Anazodo, R.O. et al. "Civil Service Reforms in Nigeria: The Journey so far in Service Delivery." In Singaporean Journal of Business Economic and Management Studies. Vol. 1 No. 2, 2012:15.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Maduabum, C. *Reforming Government Bureaucracies in Nigeria: The Journey So* Far. Lagos: ASCON Publishers, 2006. 65.

who were the accounting officers of the ministries, had become corrupt and had enmassed power.<sup>5</sup>

The features of the reform were that a Minister was made both the Chief Executive and the accounting officer of his ministry.<sup>6</sup> The office of the permanent secretary was replaced with the office of the Director-General and was made political.<sup>7</sup> They were meant to retire with the President or Governor; thus making their position non-permanent.<sup>8</sup> The Permanent Secretary/Director-General had a choice whether or not to accept the post. The reform also professionalized the Civil Service, because every officer or specialist made his career entirely in his ministry or department.<sup>9</sup> For example, medical officers, teachers or civil engineers will remain for the whole of their service in their ministries. Some ministries were merged, for instance Ministry of Finance was merged with the Ministry of National Planning.<sup>10</sup>

In Katsina State, the 1988 reform opened the way for an influx of non-career officers or generalists into the Civil Service.<sup>11</sup> That is those officers whose appointment is usually for a tenure which is limited to a period. These were appointed as Director Generals in the service. The creation of the office of the Director General was a political appointment made by the governors to appoint whosoever they wish, without putting into consideration their lack of experience and knowledge of issues at hand.<sup>12</sup>

## 1995 Civil Service Reform in Katsina State

The 1988 reforms had a lot of defects that affected the Civil Service. For instance, the politicalizing of the office of the Permanent-Secretary had contributed to laying down the foundation of politics in the service.<sup>13</sup> In view of that the General Sani

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Oshisami, K. "Public Accountability in the Civil Service." *Being a paper presented at the workshop for Honourable Ministers, Directors-General and Heads of Extra-Ministerial Departments in the Federal Civil* Service. Lagos, 1989. 1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup>Civil Service (Re-organization) Decree No. 43, 1988. 5.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup>Civil Service (Re-organization) Decree No. 43, 1988. 5.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup>Anazcodo, R.O. et al. "Civil Service Reforms in Nigeria the So Far." *Singaporean Journal of Business Economics and Management Studies*. Vol. 1 No. 2, 2012:15.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup>Civil Service (Re-organization) Decree No. 43, 1988. 5.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Civil Service (Re-organization) Decree No. 43, 1988.5.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Rafindai, M. E. H. Age 63. Interviewed at Rafindadi Quarters, Katsina on 19/7/2018.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Rafindai.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Bala, S. Age 65. Civil Servant. Interviewed at Kofar Kaura Layout, Katsina on 5/11/2018.

Abacha regime abolished the 1988 reform.<sup>14</sup> Because the top Civil Servants had protested that, the reform had destroyed the Civil Service.<sup>15</sup>

Thus, the government set up a reform panel under the Chairmanship of Allison Ayida in 1995.<sup>16</sup> The panel was meant to examine the various provisions of the 1988 reform and make recommendations on how best to improve performance and efficiency.<sup>17</sup> Above all, they are to examine the abolition of the office of the Head of Service and the pooling system.<sup>18</sup>

After studying the recommendations, the panel recommended that the minister should continue to be the head of the ministry, but he should not be the accounting officer.<sup>19</sup> The panel also recommended that the title of Permanent Secretary should be restored.<sup>20</sup> Also, the position should only be associated with career civil servants. The panel also recommended the re-introduction of the office of the Head of Service. In addition, the ministries should be structured according to their objectives, functions and sizes and not on a uniform pattern.<sup>21</sup> The Government in turn accepted the recommendations made by the Ayida panel.

In Katsina Civil Service, the office of the Head of Service was established in 1996.<sup>22</sup> The office of the Director General was replaced with that of the Permanent Secretary. It should be noted that the Governors in the state had continued with the tenets of the 1988 reforms.<sup>23</sup> For example, the clause that had politicized the office of the Permanent Secretary under the decree. They continued to make the appointment of Permanent Secretary political that is their tenure still depended on the governor. Therefore, in many cases, the Governors both the military and civilians continued to retain Permanent-Secretary exceeding their retirement period.<sup>24</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup>Review Panel on the Civil Service Reforms: Main Report. Abuja, 1995. 1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup>Review Panel on the Civil Service Reforms. 2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Anazcodo, 15.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup>Anazcodo, "Civil Service Reforms in Nigeria the So Far." 15.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Pooling System is a Structure whereby officers remain in their Ministry or Department or their Specialization for the whole of their service. See Anazcodo et al. 15-16.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup>Review Panel on the Civil Service Reforms. 36-37.
 <sup>20</sup>Review Panel on the Civil Service Reforms. 37.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup>Review Panel on the Civil Ser

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup>Anazodo et al 15.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Abdallah, A. Age 65. Retired Civil Servant. Interview at Kofar Marusa Layout, Katsina on 1/11/2018.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Interview Rafindadi.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Interview with Bala.

## The 1999–2007 Civil Servant Reforms in Katsina State

These Reforms were introduced by the Democratic Government of President Olusegun Obasanjo to build a Civil Service that is efficient. The reform aimed to re-position and re-professionalize the public service for greater efficiency, effectiveness in service delivery, accountability and transparency.<sup>25</sup> Hence, some of the numerous features of the reform include Pension Reform which entails the compulsory contributory pension scheme. The scheme is to be funded by both the employer and the employee.<sup>26</sup> The scheme has it, that officers should set aside a certain percentage of their take-home pay.<sup>27</sup> The pension act mandated that 7.5% of the officers take home should be paid to them at retirement.<sup>28</sup>

Restructuring and Repositioning of Ministries was aimed towards solving the problem of duplication and overlapping functions between agencies and tiers of the Government.<sup>29</sup> The policy recommended that respective ministries be restructured between 4 to 8 departments depending on the scope and responsibilities of the ministries.<sup>30</sup> Other features of the reform include downsizing staff strength.<sup>31</sup> It was aimed at minimizing personnel costs as well as redundancy in the public service.<sup>32</sup> Other features of the reform include monetization which entailed the process of ascertaining the actual cost of governance in order to prevent wastages and financial leakages in all government businesses, and to upgrade the package of the public servants.<sup>33</sup> There was also the Financial Regulations and Anti-Corruption Policy which was aimed at checking corruption and financial mismanagement in Government. This policy gave birth to the establishment of the Independent Corrupt Practices and Other Related Offences Commission (ICPC) and Economic and Financial Crimes Commission (EFCC) in 2000.<sup>34</sup>

## The 2007 Civil Service Reform

In 2007 the Umaru Yar'adua-led administration came to power. The administration continued with the reform policies of its predecessor.<sup>35</sup> However, the administration

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Maduabum, *Reforming Government Bureaucracies in Nigeria: The Journey So Far.* 129.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Ake et al. "Nigeria Civil Service Reform of 1999–2007. An Analysis of Controversies." 70.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup>Ake et al. 70.

 $<sup>^{\</sup>rm 28}$  Maduabum, 181.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Maduabum,181.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup>Maduabum, 136.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> Maduabum, 136.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Okorie, C.O. et al. "A Survey of Public Service Reform in Nigeria 1999–2013." *In International Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences.* Vol 4 No. 10, 2014:259.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup>Okorie, 259.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup>Okorie, 270.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> Okorie, et al "A Survey of Public Service Reforms in Nigeria 1999–2013."272.

decided to review the reform policy of restructuring.<sup>36</sup> This led to the establishment of the Steve Oronsanya Committee in 2007.<sup>37</sup> The Committee was to review the restructuring reform policy of Obasanjo. After much consultations and studies, the Committee viewed that, there were many Personnel Directors and Permanent Secretaries in the Federal Civil Service that had crowded the service, by staying at the top for long.<sup>38</sup> In addition, there were very young bright, energetic and efficient officers who have been prevented from attaining top positions.<sup>39</sup> Thus the result of this, was that the Committee recommended the retirement of these senior officers who had stayed for long. Hence the birth of the tenure reform system policy.<sup>40</sup> The policy mandated the compulsory retirement of Personnel Directors and Permanent Secretaries who have served for two terms of four consecutive years.<sup>41</sup>

In Katsina State Civil Service, the government implemented the 2007 tenure system.<sup>42</sup>The Government claimed that the implementation was to pave the way for the young and upcoming officers to assume top positions.<sup>43</sup> However, the reform implied that the Civil Service in Katsina did not have adequate manpower, as compared to the Federal Service.<sup>44</sup>The result was that a lot of young, abled, dedicated, experienced and professionalized officers were affected.<sup>45</sup> They retired at the peak of their career and at a time when their services were much needed. In addition, these senior officers who should have trained and led the way for the junior officers were retired.<sup>46</sup> This brought about a serious lack of professionalism in the state.<sup>47</sup>For instance, there were lots of medical doctors, veterinary doctors, agricultural specialists, educationists and a host of others affected.<sup>48</sup> The result of this was that, in some departments, there were no longer any officers of the senior cadre. An example could be seen in the department of livestock in the Ministry of

<sup>39</sup>Okorie, 272.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup>Okorie, 272.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup>Okorie, 272.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup>Okorie, 272.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup>Ake, et al. "Nigeria Civil Service Reform of 1999–2007." 70.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup>Okorie, 272.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup>Interview with Danyaya.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup>Danyaya.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup>Ingawa, S. Age 51. Civil Servant.Interviewed at Katsina State Ministry of Establishment and Training on 25/8/2018.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup>Daku, I. M. Age 54. Civil Servant. Katsina State Governor's Office, Katsina on 5/12/2019.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup>Daku.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup>Safana, S. Y. Age 60. Civil Servant. Interviewed at State Secretariat Complex, Katsina on 4/4/2018.
 <sup>48</sup>Interview with Ingawa.

A publication of Department of History and Security Studies, UMYUK pg. 84

Agriculture where there were no senior officers after the implementation of the reform.<sup>49</sup>

## **Training of Civil Servants**

Training and re-retraining of civil servants in the Civil Service is of paramount importance. This is to provide an effective and efficient service.<sup>50</sup> Thus the main objective of training is to provide an enabling ground for Civil Servants to acquire added knowledge, which will enable them to perform well and to the expectation of the entire populace.<sup>51</sup> The training department in Katsina State Civil Service facilitates the training of state officers in the service. The training department undertakes the training based on recommendations from the Ministries, Departments and Agencies for their staff.<sup>52</sup> The training is available to all cadres ranging from junior, middle and senior, and it cuts across all areas of specialization. However, the MDAs are given delegated power to train the Junior Cadre 01-06.<sup>53</sup>

The training in Katsina State Civil Service was available in the following categories namely:

Basic course, which is the training given to new employees for instance induction course to prepare them to be acquainted with the Civil Service rules.<sup>54</sup> There was also on-the-job training, which was to serve under a specialized officer who trains the newly recruited officers on their schedule. Then there is the regular course, which is a training given to officers who have served for two years and above.<sup>55</sup> Inservice training, which includes workshops, seminars and conferences, in-house and outside the country, including international training.<sup>56</sup>

It is important to note that Katsina State Civil Service undertakes the training of officers on study leave with pay, and part-time programmes.<sup>57</sup> Furthermore, the State Government trains officers on short courses in the following accredited institutions: Administrative Staff College of Nigeria (ASCON) in Lagos; Centre for Management Development (CMD) in Lagos, Industrial Training Fund (ITF),

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup>Ingawa.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup>Ingawa.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup>Interview with Danyaya.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup>Katsina State Department of Establishment, Pension and Training: Report on Training, 2009.1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup>Katsina State Department of Establishment, Pension and Training: Report on Training, 2009.1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> Saulawa, H. T. Age 50. Civil Servant. Interviewed at Ministry of Establishment and Training, Katsina on 27/11/2019.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup>Saulawa.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup>Saulawa.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup>Katsina State Department of Establishment, Pension and Training: Report on Training, 2009.1.

Chartered Institute of Accountant, the National Institute for Policy and Strategic Studies (NIPSS) Jos Plateau. The State Government also undertakes moral and financial sponsorship of officers on training.<sup>58</sup>

The Government in Katsina has established institutions of higher learning for the training of Civil Servants. In fact, the state had a Civil Service institution inherited from Kaduna State, which was established in 1973 under the defunct office of the Head of Service which is situated in Funtua town.<sup>59</sup> The College was established with the objective of training administrative and executive officers of the Junior Cadre in Certificate Courses.<sup>60</sup> In 2012 the State Civil Service proposed for the upgrade of College to offer National Diploma Courses.<sup>61</sup>

The training programme in Katsina State Civil Service has played an important role in the development of manpower in the state.<sup>62</sup> Upon the creation of Katsina State in 1987, there were only two institutions of higher learning, which were the State Polytechnic, and the Federal College of Education.<sup>63</sup> However, the state has three more universities, which are Umaru Musa Yar'adua University, Katsina Islamic University (Al-Qalam), and Federal University Dutsin-ma. In addition, there were other Colleges of higher learning such as the College of Legal Studies, and other Colleges of Health Sciences situated at Katsina Metropolis, Daura, Kankia and Malumfashi. The result of this development is that the state has trained and produced manpower in various fields of human endeavour.<sup>64</sup>

## **Payment of Gratuities and Pension**

The National Scheme of Service and the Civil Service rules have spelt out the mandatory service years of officers in the Civil Service, at the end of the expiration of the years, officers are expected to retire from service.<sup>65</sup> The compulsory retirement age for all grades in the service is 60 years of age or 35 years of service, whichever comes earlier.<sup>66</sup> The affected officers are entitled to gratuity and pension grants. In order to ensure that officers receive their retirement benefits promptly, the Department of Pension is required to forward certain documents of the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup>Katsina State Department of Establishment, Pension and Training: Report on Training, 2009.1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup>Danabu, L. Age 50. Civil Servant. Interviewed at Civil Service Commission, Katsina on 4/12/2019.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>60</sup>Katsina State Department of Establishment, Pension and Training. Report on Training, 2014. 2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>61</sup>Katsina State Department of Establishment, Pension and Training. Report on Training, 2014. 2.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>62</sup>Aliyu, M. L. Age 61. Civil Servant. Interviewed at Kofar Kaura Layout, Katsina on 18/9/2018.
 <sup>63</sup>Aliyu.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>64</sup>Aliyu.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>65</sup>Federal Republic of Nigeria Scheme of Service for Use in the Federal Civil Service. Revised 2003:22.
<sup>66</sup>Federal Republic of Nigeria Scheme of Service, 22.

concerned officers.<sup>67</sup> These include up-to-date records of service, pension forms, stamped death certificates (for deceased officers), Birth certificates or sworn declarations of age among others. The Government is expected in turn to prepare for the eventual prompt payment of gratuities and pensions as at when due.<sup>68</sup>

Katsina State government pays the gratuities and pensions of retired civil servants when due.<sup>69</sup> The government set aside funds which were strictly meant for the payment of retirement benefits and death gratuities.<sup>70</sup> It should be noted that with the advent of democratic administration, the Government introduced the quarterly payment of gratuities.<sup>71</sup> That is in every four (4) months the Government settles the gratuities of retired officers.

The payment of gratuities and pensions in Katsina State has been politicized.<sup>72</sup> This is because the government does not hasten the payment of benefits.<sup>73</sup> For instance, the second democratic administration which came on board in 2007, neglected the payment of retirement benefits. That is from 2009–2014, during that period all retired and deceased officers were not paid their entitlements.<sup>74</sup> But during that period various contractual projects were carried out. For instance, the government constructed the Barhim Housing Unit in 2009. It was not until 2015 when the governor took over and settled the debt.<sup>75</sup> Secondly, issues of corruption such as bribes, extortion and favouritism have become key factors in the payment of gratuities and pensions.<sup>76</sup> It has become on whom you know, even though, it is the right of the concerned officers.<sup>77</sup> Likewise, concerned officers or retirees usually engage in giving bribes, to include their names for the payment of their benefits.<sup>78</sup> The officers in charge of processing payments usually force retirees to provide them with a token amount, before processing their papers.<sup>79</sup> Hence retired officers or family members of deceased officers face a lot of hardship before being paid.<sup>80</sup> As

<sup>76</sup>Interviewed with Danyaya.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>67</sup>Federal Republic of Nigeria Scheme of Service, 21-22.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>68</sup>Federal Republic of Nigeria Scheme of Service, 21-22.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>69</sup>Interview with Abdallah.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>70</sup>Abdallah.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>71</sup>Abdallah.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>72</sup>Kofar Bai, A. I.Age 57. Civil Servant. Interviewed at Kofar Bai Quarters, Katsina on 25/2/2019.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>73</sup>Oral Interview with Abdulazeez Idris K/Bai.,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>74</sup>Interview with Bala.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>75</sup>Bala.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>77</sup> Ingawa, R. M. Age 48. Civil Servant. Interviewed at Cabinet Office, Katsina State Governor's Office Katsina on 29/11/2019.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>78</sup>Ingawa,

<sup>79</sup>Danyaya.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>80</sup>Bala

regards to payment of monthly pensions, the State Government made plans to implement the Obasanjo Reform Pension Scheme.<sup>81</sup> This was because; the economic situation in the state was not buoyant as before.<sup>82</sup> Introducing the reform will cut government expenses.<sup>83</sup>

## The Politics of Minimum Wage

Part of the constitution laws of Nigeria is that salaries and wages of the officers should be reviewed and increased after every five years.<sup>84</sup> Hence it is mandatory and the prerogative of the Government to pay officers of the Civil Service their wages monthly, as laid down by the Civil Service rules.<sup>85</sup> Wages are paid according to cadres, and based on years. Thus the Government had made efforts to review workers' salaries from the pre-independence to the post-independence period.<sup>86</sup> The contention is that wages should be paid to meet the cost of living. Hence the yearnings and aspirations of every Civil Servant is to receive wages that will meet the cost of living.<sup>87</sup>

In Katsina State Civil Service, the government since the creation of the State in 1987, had adopted all the salary reforms of the Federal Government.<sup>88</sup> In 1988 barely a year after the creation of the State, the Government of Ibrahim Babangida set up a review panel to review the national minimum wages. In 1992/1993 the minimum wage was reviewed to N1,700.<sup>89</sup> In 1999 the Government reviewed the minimum wage from N1,700 to N3,000.<sup>90</sup> In 2001, the minimum wage was increased to N6,000 from N3,000. In 2005, another increment was made, where 12.5% was increased over the minimum wage.<sup>91</sup> The government further reviewed the minimum wage to 15%, in 2007<sup>92</sup>. In 2012 the Government reviewed the minimum wage to N18,000.<sup>93</sup> Hence the government in Katsina State implemented all the reviewed minimum wages. The government injunction with the State

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>81</sup>Bala.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>82</sup>Gambo, I. L. Age 58. Civil Servant.Interviewed atMinistry of Education, Katsina on 28/3/2018.
 <sup>83</sup>Gambo.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>84</sup>Civil Service Rules for Use in the Federal Republic of Nigeria. Revised 1977:42.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>85</sup>Maduabum, 253.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>86</sup>Oral Interview with Tanimu Lawal Saulawa, 52 years, Kwado Quarters, Katsina, 6/11/2018.
<sup>87</sup>Ibid

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>88</sup>Tune, I. U. Remarks made at the Opening Session of 3 Day re-Retirement Training, Katsina, September 2018, p.1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>89</sup>Saulawa, T.I. "Historical Background of Nigerian Labour Congress (NLC) Katsina Council." *Paper Presented at the Celebration of Workers Day, Katsina*, 2015:15-16.

<sup>90</sup>Saulawa, 15-16.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>91</sup>Saulawa, 15-16.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>92</sup> Saulawa, 15-16.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>93</sup> Saulawa, T.I. "Historical Background of Nigerian Labour Congress (NLC) Katsina Council."15-16.

National Labour Congress has made tremendous achievements in terms of workers' wages.<sup>94</sup> The National Labour Congress in Katsina negotiated and ensured the implementation of the N3,000 minimum wage on 12<sup>th</sup> March 1999. It also ensured that the government implemented the N6,000 minimum wage in 2001 after a long industrial strike action. Likewise, it ensured that the Government implemented the remaining minimum wages reviewed by the Federal Government.<sup>95</sup> It is important to note that there is a disparity in the payment of wages in the Civil Service. This is because Permanent Secretaries have what is called a consolidated salary, because Permanent- Secretaries and Directors are entitled to 4 and 2 domestic staff respectively. The Government includes the wages of the domestic staff in their salaries.<sup>96</sup>

Screening Exercise, Retrenchment and the Politics of Reinstatement in Katsina State

It is mandatory for the government to clean its payroll otherwise known as a screening exercise. The screening exercise is at the discretion of the Governor.<sup>97</sup> The objective is to ensure that actual Civil Servants are paid.<sup>98</sup> To eliminate names of deceased, retired and those officers who have withdrawn from the service.<sup>99</sup> It is also to aid the Civil Service in areas of manpower need of the government.<sup>100</sup> Excess money is found in the payroll to be used for revenue generation in development plans and the welfare of the officers in the service.<sup>101</sup> However, issues of screening exercises in Katsina State Civil Service have been politicized because of the excessive use of consultancy services which was introduced by the Civilian Government.<sup>102</sup> The use of consultancy services has been introduced by the democratic administration. This is despite the fact that the Civil Service can screen itself.<sup>103</sup>

However, it is important to note that the Government has claimed that it uses consultancy when it lacks that kind of specialization in the service.<sup>104</sup> In addition,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>94</sup>Gini, N. M. Age 51. Civil Servant. Interviewed at Saulawa Quarters, Katsina on 21/11/2019.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>95</sup>Gini.

<sup>96</sup>Gini.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>97</sup>Sani, M. A. Age 49. Civil Servant. Interviewed at Cabinet Office, Katsina State Governor's Office, Katsina on 16/7/2019.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>98</sup>Isyaku, U. Age 50. Civil Servant. Interviewed at Human Resource Department Katsina on 14/8/2018.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>99</sup>Isyaku.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>100</sup> Isyaku.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>101</sup> Interview with Rafindai.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>102</sup> Rafindai.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>103</sup> Interview with Bala.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>104</sup> Bala.

it is also to have independent judgment thereby avoiding biased judgment.<sup>105</sup> For instance, in 2014 in response to the directives of the Federal Government to migrate from Analogue to digital system of payments.<sup>106</sup>The State Government employed the Service of the United Bank for Africa (UBA),<sup>107</sup> UBA carried out the migration of salary after screening the officers.<sup>108</sup> Likewise in 2014, the Government sought the services of the Administrative Staff College of Nigeria (ASCON) Lagos.<sup>109</sup> ASCON conducted a recruitment exercise of about 105 officers.<sup>110</sup> Other consultancy firms include contractual firms used by the government in the construction and supervision of projects.<sup>111</sup>

On the issue of Retrenchment, the first retrenchment exercise in Katsina State Civil Service was conducted during the military regime in 1997.<sup>112</sup> The criteria were redundancy and disciplinary actions. The second retrenchment took place during the democratic dispensation, during the Umaru Yar'adua regime.<sup>113</sup> In 2004/2005 some 49 Civil Servants which include accountants, teachers and one principal were found guilty of financial embezzlement of Government funds.<sup>114</sup> After investigating by the government, the guilty 49 officers were dismissed.<sup>115</sup> Afterwards, during the Shema-led administration in 2007, the Government retrenched some officers from the thirty-four local government, who were claimed to be Ghost workers.<sup>116</sup> In 2015 a new Government took over and conducted its own retrenchment, after conducting screening of the payroll in the thirty-four local governments.<sup>117</sup> The result was that, all redundant staff and those who have withdrawn from the service otherwise known as Ghost-workers were dismissed.<sup>118</sup>

Katsina State government both military and civilian had carried out screening and retrenchment, in its bid to sanitize the payroll.<sup>119</sup> However, politics tended to play

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>105</sup> Musa, A. Age 52. Civil Servant. Interviewed at Cabinet Office, Katsina State Governor's Office, Katsina on 17/7/2018.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>106</sup> Musa.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>107</sup> Musa.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>108</sup> Bello, A. Age 48. Civil Servant. Interviewed at Katsina State Governor's Office, Katsina on 17/7/2019
 <sup>109</sup> Bello.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>110</sup> Bello.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>111</sup> Interview with Ingawa.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>112</sup> Kafur, L. M. Age 64. Retired Civil Servant. Interviewed at Kofar Marusa Layout, Katsina on 29/7/2018.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>113</sup> Kafur.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>114</sup> Kafur.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>115</sup> Ingawa.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>116</sup> Ingawa.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>117</sup> Ingawa.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>118</sup> Ingawa.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>119</sup> Ingawa.

a role in the retrenchment of workers in the Civil Service. This is a fact because succeeding governments in many cases reinstate retrenched staff.<sup>120</sup> For instance, the Shema-led administration converted the dismissal of some retrenched staff during Umaru's regime to retirement.<sup>121</sup> Although NLC in Katsina played a leading role in their reinstatement.<sup>122</sup> Also, some were of the view that due process was not followed.<sup>123</sup>Likewise the Masari-led administration, as part of its campaign promise, reinstated those localgovernment Staff that were retrenched by the Shema-led administration.<sup>124</sup> In addition, the administration further conducted another fresh screening of both local and state government staff. The result of that was the retrenchment of another batch of staff, which the government claimed were redundant and illegal officers.<sup>125</sup>

S/No.	Cadre	Number of Staff
1	Financial Controller	10
2	Salary Accountant	15
3	Salary Clerk	15
4	School Bursar	4
5	School Teacher	4
6	School Principal	1
	Total	49

**Source:** Oral Interview conducted with Director Training, Ministry of Establishment and Training Katsina State. 25/9/2018.

The table below is a list of 49 officers dismissed during the Umaru Musa Yar'adua administration over allegations of financial corruption. It should be noted that these officers were punished after being found guilty. In addition, this list is a sample.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>120</sup> Interview with Bala.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>121</sup> Bala.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>122</sup> Saulawa, T. L.Age 52. Civil Servant. Interviewed at Nigeria Labour Congress Office (NLC) Office, Sabon Layi, Katsinaon 6/11/2018.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>123</sup> Saulawa.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>124</sup> Kafur.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>125</sup> Ingawa.

## Success and Challenges of the Katsina State Civil Service

The Civil Service in Katsina State has achieved tremendous success from its inception in that it has changed the lives of the entire populace. Changes began to be witnessed from the first week of its creation. Hence the development of infrastructure is one of the greatest achievements. Roads were constructed, which in turn brought about changes in the economic activities of the state.

Another significant success of the Civil Service is the production of manpower. Upon the creation of the state, the government embarked on expansion and establishment of institutions, in order to meet the growing number of learners.<sup>126</sup> Likewise, the government undertook the massive recruitment of teachers. There were about 2,174 primary schools and 822 secondary schools owned by the government as of 2012.<sup>127</sup> In addition, to support the growing number of schools, there are also privately owned primary and secondary schools. The state has the following tertiary institutions: Umaru Musa Yar'adua University Katsina Islamic University, Hassan Usman Katsina, Hassan Usman Katsina Polytechnic, Federal College of Education, Isa Kaita College of Education, Bala Usman College of Legal and General Studies, Usman Danfodio Institute, School of Basic and Remedial Studies, Bala Abdullahi College of Administration, School of Health Technology Kankia, School of Health Technology Daura, School of Nursing Katsina and School of Health Technology, Malumfashi.<sup>128</sup>

As a result of the establishment and expansion of institutions, the state has produced many graduates in various fields of human endeavour.<sup>129</sup> In addition, the state has undertaken massive training of manpower in various capacities both nationally and internationally.<sup>130</sup> This development led to the birth of manpower who were trained in various professional fields. Hence the state has a lot of specialists in medicine, computers and engineering.<sup>131</sup>

Indeed the development of the Civil Service in Katsina State has helped in the generation of employment. Also due to the stability of the Civil Service peace has

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>126</sup> Interview with Ingawa.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>127</sup> Shinkafi, N. K. Age 58. Civil Servant.Interviewed at WTC Road Katsina on 2/8/2018.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>128</sup> Katsina State of Nigeria Education Sector Strategic Plan (SES), 2010–2011, 2016:6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>129</sup> Kurfi, A. "Know Your State – Katsina" PaperPresented at Katsina, nd,9-10.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>130</sup> Aliyu, M. L. Age 61. Civil Servant. Interviewed at Kofar Kaura Layout, Katsina, 18/9/2018.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>131</sup> Aliyu.

reigned in the state. Thus this has helped in attracting people from various places to Katsina.<sup>132</sup>

On health issues, the state has an adequate number of health institutions which are equipped with the necessary manpower and facilities to cater for the growing number of population.<sup>133</sup>Hence the state has about 604 health centres and institutions located at various parts of the state.<sup>134</sup> There are about 50 private health centres, 1 specialist and 1 orthopaedic hospital respectively.<sup>135</sup>

On work, housing and transport, from the establishment of the Civil Service, the state embarked on the construction, expansion and rehabilitation of roads, in order to ease and provide safety for the population.<sup>136</sup> The state constructed major arterial roads that linked strategic centres of economic activities such as Katsina- Tsagero - Mani Road; Tama-Charanchi-Matazu- Marrarbar Musawa etc. In addition, the government constructed Katsina township roads and the construction of new GRA Road among several others.<sup>137</sup>

On housing, the government constructed its first housing estate in 1989 in Dutsin-Safe which contained 100 houses.<sup>138</sup> These houses were constructed in the 7 original local governments.

44 in Katsina, 12 in Daura, 12 in Funtua, 12 in Malumfashi, and 8 in Dutsinma, Mani and Kankia respectively.<sup>139</sup> About 70% of the houses were allocated to Civil Servants on hire purchase.<sup>140</sup> In 2005 the Government constructed the Goruba Housing Estate which contained 272 houses.<sup>141</sup>The Government further constructed the following houses: Barhim Housing Estate in 2009 - 500 houses; Makera Housing Estate in 2011 - 252 units; Fatima Shema Estate in 2013 - 250 units and Ahmadu Bello Estate in 2014 - 510 units respectively.<sup>142</sup>

It is important to note that the government constructed the State Secretariat in 2005, which solved the problem of office accommodation problem.<sup>143</sup> The government

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>132</sup> Aliyu.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>133</sup> Daura, L. M. Age 75. Retired Civil Servant. Interviewed at Kofar Marusa Layout, Katsina on 27/3/2018.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>134</sup> Kurfi, "Know Your State - Katsina" PaperPresented at Katsina, nd, 9-10.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>135</sup> Kurfi, 9-10.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>136</sup> Kurfi, 9-10.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>137</sup> Kurfi, 9-10.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>138</sup> Kurfi, 9-10.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>139</sup> Duwan, U. B. Age 59. Civil Servant. Interviewed at Katsina State Housing Authority, Katsina on 27/2/2019.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>140</sup> Duwan.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>141</sup> Duwan.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>142</sup> Duwan.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>143</sup> Duwan.

also constructed an airport, which was later upgraded to an International Status in 2007. This development solved the problem of airlifting pilgrims to the holy land in Saudi Arabia, which prior to that was conducted in Kano.<sup>144</sup>

The State Civil Service under the government undertakes the welfare of its officers which includes medical assistance at the national and international level for them and their families,<sup>145</sup> provision of a housing scheme on owner-occupier status and vehicle and refurbishing revolving loans.<sup>146</sup> Also, the State can boast of prompt payment of salaries and other entitlements of Civil Servants.<sup>147</sup>

However, despite the successes achieved by the Civil Service, it is not left without challenges which have impeded its development.<sup>148</sup> These challenges were gradual and became prominent during the civil administration.

One of the greatest challenges facing the Civil Service in Katsina is that of issues of politics which has ravaged the Civil Service.<sup>149</sup> Politics since its inception has always not been in favour of the Civil Service.<sup>150</sup> Thus appointments, placements and general movement of staff have been affected by politics.<sup>151</sup> Professionalism was no longer observed and considered as a criterion for appointment.<sup>152</sup> Rather sycophancy and issues of godfatherism were the leading proponents in terms of appointment.<sup>153</sup> The issues of the quota system have also contributed greatly in destroying the Civil Service.<sup>154</sup>

Since the inception of democratic rule, the government which is the executive arm has centralized the Civil Service.<sup>155</sup> For instance, the administration tackles responsibilities and duties which are otherwise functions of the Civil Service.<sup>156</sup>

148 Mani.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>144</sup> Duwan.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>145</sup> Interview with Abdallah.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>146</sup> Modibbo, A.Age 80. Businessman. Interviewed at GRA Katsina on 30/10/2018.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>147</sup> Mani, G. S. Age 59. Civil Servant. Interviewed at Kofar Kaura Layout, Katsina on 15/1/2019.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>149</sup> Rafindadi, M. E. H. Age 63. Retired Civil Servant. Interviewed at Rafindadi Quarters, Katsina on 19/7/2018.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>149</sup> Rafindadi.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>150</sup> Interview with Danyaya.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>151</sup> Interview with Sani.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>152</sup> Rafindadi.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>153</sup> Rafindadi.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>154</sup>Interview with Shinkafi.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>155</sup> Shinkafi.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>156</sup> Danyaya.

Another challenge is that of corruption which destroyed the Civil Service.<sup>157</sup> It has penetrated through all cadres, ranging from the senior to the junior officers,<sup>158</sup> issues of favouritism, sectionalism nepotism and financial mismanagement.<sup>159</sup> It is important to note that the award of the contract became based on partisan politics.<sup>160</sup> Politicians usually award contracts to their vestiges, in order to satisfy and fulfil campaign promises.<sup>161</sup> the Civil Service in Katsina has lost its feature of being neutral. They aligned themselves with the government of the day.<sup>162</sup>

Another challenge is the lack of professionalism and qualification.<sup>163</sup> The Civil Service has serious administrative gaps and lacks professionalism; especially with the implementation of the tenure system of Directors, under the Obasanjo reform policy.<sup>164</sup> This policy has negated the Civil Service. It was implemented without careful consultation and study of issues on the ground.<sup>152</sup>

There was a lack of motivation, probably due to the economic setback. Thus, officers in the Civil Service have lost their sense of commitment, zeal and dedication towards serving the Government.<sup>153</sup> As such, they have become selfish and tend to engage in duties that will fetch monetary incentives.<sup>165</sup> Training of officers especially induction courses, seminars and workshops was inadequate. As such officers lack new knowledge in discharging their duties. They have also become redundant.<sup>166</sup>

There is a lack of bureaucracy and a lack of regard for Civil Services rules.<sup>167</sup> That is non-strict adherence to due process in the Civil Service.<sup>168</sup> The State Executive became selective and interfered in policy-making, implementation and the normal routine task of administration.<sup>169</sup>For example, there are cases where proposals or memos for policies and programmes not directed through the right channel, instead were sent directly to the Governor for approval.<sup>170</sup> In some cases, the Governor

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>157</sup> Kankara, S. Age 80. Retired Civil Servant. Interviewed at Kofar Marusa Layout, Katsina on 31/10/2018.
 <sup>158</sup> Kafur.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>159</sup> Kafur.

<sup>160</sup> Karur.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>160</sup> Kafur.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>161</sup> Kankara.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>162</sup> Shinkafi.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>163</sup> Kankara.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>164</sup> Ingawa,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>165</sup> Interview with Danyaya.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>166</sup> Danyaya.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>167</sup> Danyaya.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>168</sup> Danyaya.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>169</sup> Interview with Sani.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>170</sup> Sani.

gave directives without consulting the Civil Service.<sup>171</sup> For instance, the Shema-led administration constructed about 64 secondary schools in the 34 Local Governments in the state without consulting the Ministry of Education.<sup>172</sup>

Lack of discipline is another challenge facing the Civil Service in Katsina State.<sup>173</sup> Thus some officers felt they were above the law. In many cases, junior officers, bypassed the departmental heads, and went directly to the Permanent Secretary or the Commissioner to lodge their complaints. It is a known fact that many officers usually have access to the Governor on issues that can be readily solved in their duty stations.<sup>174</sup>

There was inadequate welfare in the Civil Service. Especially housing projects which were constructed for the officers, were usually given to the politicians.<sup>175</sup> For instance, the first housing estate constructed in 1989, 70% of the housing units were distributed to workers.<sup>176</sup> However over the years as more housing units were constructed, the number given to workers gradually reduced.<sup>177</sup> In many cases, the price rate for the house was very high to the extent that the Junior Cadre officers could hardly afford it. This prevents them from owning a house in the city.

## Conclusion

The sustenance of the Civil Service has immensely contributed to stabilizing the polity in Katsina. It was observed that the peaceful atmosphere enjoyed in Katsina is attributed to the stability of the Civil Service. Likewise, the establishment of the Civil Service has played a significant role in providing an enabling ground for the development of manpower. The state has an adequate number of trained and qualified manpower in various fields of human endeavour. However, despite this achievement, certain reform policies adopted by the Civil Service have contributed in crippling professionalism in the service and have served as a detriment to staff development. These reforms have provided huge professional gaps in the service

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>171</sup> Interview with Kafur.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>172</sup> Interview with Shinkafi.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>173</sup> Shinkafi.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>174</sup> Shinkafi.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>175</sup> Interview with Rafindadi.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>176</sup> Abdulazeez.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>177</sup> Abdulazeez.